ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

MAPPING SEMANTIC SHIFTS: A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF JAWAB-I-SHIKWA IN HUMAN AND AI-GENERATED TRANSLATIONS

Shahid Adil
Mphil Scholar, Department of English Language and Literature, The University of Lahore, Sargodha Campus
adilshahid786@gmail.com
Muhammad Ali Shahid
Lecturer, Department of English Language and Literature, The University of Lahore, Sargodha Campus
muhammadalishahid05@gmail.com.pk
Prof. Dr Anser Mahmood
HOD, Department of English Language and Literature, The University of Lahore, Sargodha Campus
anser.mahmood@ell.uol.edu.pk

Abstract
*The manner of translating classical Urdu poetry is drastically extra problematic than simply replacing one word with another; it requires deliberate engagement with profound theological, cultural, and emotional factors. This study investigates the semantic shifts that occur when translating Allama Iqbal's *Jawab-i-Shikwa* (*The Answer to the Complaint*), a seminal text of twentieth-century Islamic philosophy. By employing a Comparative Semantic Mapping (CSM) framework, this research contrasts the nuanced, culturally mediated human translation of M.A.K. Khalil with the probabilistic, algorithm-driven output of the Large Language Model GPT-4. Grounded in Mona Baker's Translation Universals and classical semantic shift theories, the study maps how each medium navigates the complex Persian-Arabic diction, Sufi-philosophical terminology (such as *khudi*, *ishq*, and *tawhid*), and ecstatic rhetorical structures of Iqbal's poetry. The analysis reveals that while GPT-4 exhibits high fluency and structural coherence, it is constrained by algorithmic literalism and statistical centralization, resulting in "semantic flattening." This flattening diminishes the text's rhetorical fervor, philosophical depth, and emotional resonance. Conversely, Khalil's human translation demonstrates deliberate interpretive judgments—utilizing explicitation and functional equivalence—to preserve the spiritual "spirit" and cultural manifestation of the original, even at the expense of formal structural equivalence. The findings highlight that AI-generated translations, while efficient, currently lack the hermeneutic capacity required for high-register, culturally anchored philosophical poetry. This research contributes to the growing discourse on the intersection of digital humanities and translation studies, advocating for hybrid translation models where algorithmic efficiency is coupled with humanistic, cultural mediation.*

Keywords: Semantic Shifts, Jawab-i-Shikwa, Allama Iqbal, Machine Translation, GPT-4, M.A.K. Khalil, Translation Universals, Comparative Semantic Mapping, Digital Humanities.

1. Introduction
The manner of translating classical Urdu poetry is drastically extra problematic than simply replacing one word with another; it requires deliberate engagement with profound theological, cultural, and emotional factors (Anjum, 2016). *Jawab-i-Shikwa*, additionally recognized as "The Answer to the Complaint," produced by means of Allama Iqbal, is widely regarded as a seminal e book of Islamic wondering in the course of the twentieth century. Due to the reality that it is written in Urdu that has been strongly Persianized and draws closely upon the Ghazal lifestyle in order to convey a present day social and spiritual message, its translation provides a foremost possibility for difficulty. When it comes to language processing, synthetic brain is getting closer and closer to human capabilities (Gesnot, 2025). This brings about a full-size conundrum: have to translation put extra emphasis on keeping the "spirit" of the text or that of its "structure"?

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

This conundrum is investigated in the find out about titled "Mapping Semantic Shifts: A Comparative Study of Jawab-i-Shikwa in Human and AI-Generated Translations." The article compares and contrasts the probabilistic, algorithm-driven outputs of Large Language Models (LLMs) with the nuanced interpretive judgments of human translators. The study analyzes how each media offers with semantic shifts, which are delicate changes in meaning that appear between languages. This is done through a comparative analysis of necessary stanzas. Additionally, it inquires as to whether artificial intelligence is succesful of correctly communicating the essence of *khudi*, which is the thinking of selfhood, as nicely as the top notch emotional depth that is vital to Iqbal's philosophy, or whether or not it is constrained to literal reproductions that reduce the poem's deeper importance.

The use of rhetorical questioning, Persian-Arabic diction, and references to Islamic records are some of the literary methods that Iqbal employs in order to reaffirm his attraction for a religious and ethical regeneration (Anim, 2024). In this context, some of the references that are taken into consideration are the teachings of Rumi, the Battle of Badr, and the biography of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH). He, on the different hand, lays a big amount of emphasis on the idea that the genuine strength of the Muslim community rests in its frequent have confidence in *tawhid*, which is the thought that there is only one God and that believers are unified (Ali & Hussien, 2018). He believes that this is the source of the Muslim community's strength.

The multifaceted meaning of these poems makes them both beloved and challenging to interpret. Urdu is a language that uses terms from Sanskrit, Arabic, and Persian (Maldonado Garcia, 2016). Many of these words have cultural and religious meanings that are challenging to translate into English. M.A.K. Khalil was cautious to maintain the original terminology and make it simple to read when he translated *Bang-e-Dara* into English as *Call of the Marching Bell* in 1997. They often come with annotations that explain how deep the thoughts are. Khalil's translation shows how well individuals may acquire ideas by being lyrical and culturally aware. GPT-4 and other AI translation models are quick, but they miss subtleties that modify the meaning, tone, or connotation of the original text (Yan et al., 2024). Analysing the shifts in "Jawab-i-Shikwa", this study compares and contrasts the human translation by Khalil with the results produced by artificial intelligence in order to shed light on how technology is influencing the preservation of literature.

1.2 Historical Context of Iqbal's Work

When studying "Jawab-i-Shikwa", it is beneficial to location it in the early 20th-century British India setting. The 1857 Indian Rebellion, the decline of the Mughal Empire, and the subsequent boom of the Indian independence motion were formative years for India (Britannica, 2024). Colonialism, Muslim neighborhood strife, and the force for Western cultural dominance all contributed to marginalising the previously dominant Muslim population. The European travels of Iqbal (1905–1908) influenced his poetry, which attacked materialism and referred to as for a revived Islam. Integrating Sufi traditions with modern existentialism, his thought of *khudi* (selfhood) states that the person ego evolves by belief and effort (Azad, 2014).

In 1911, the poem *Shikwa*, which is considered to be each bold and controversial, was delivered for the first time, and it at once elicited widespread reactions from spiritual leaders as properly as the popular people (Suprayetno et al., 2024). *Jawab-i-Shikwa*, the partner piece to this work, used to be at the beginning given in 1913 at a mosque in Lahore. It is usual for the message that it conveys, which is each inspirational and reconciliatory. Through these poems, Iqbal addresses the Muslim neighborhood directly, urging them to acquire together, engage in crucial introspection over their ethical behavior, and take heroic moves in order to overcome their collective fall (Mushtaq, 2025). The intellectual surroundings that would sooner or later have an have an impact on on the Pakistan Movement was once drastically shaped by this work, which, together with *Shikwa's* contributions, performed this function.

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

In his well-known Allahabad Address, which took place in 1930, Iqbal in addition refined his political vision. In this address, he outlined the thinking of a Muslim state in South Asia that would govern itself. This speech is today considered to be one of the most giant addresses in the history of modern-day times. Both *Shikwa* and *Jawab-i-Shikwa* are nonetheless taught in instructional institutions all at some stage in Pakistan (Irshad & Yasmin, 2025). This is due to the truth that both of these texts maintain large historical, intellectual, and cultural significance. The issues of self-awakening, resistance to oppression, and religious rejuvenation that they explore have also served as a supply of idea for anti-colonial thought and actions across the Muslim world, together with nations like as Africa and the Middle East (Saadi, 2024). It is for this cause that Iqbal's poetic and philosophical ideas proceed to have everlasting relevance on a worldwide scale, which further bolsters his ongoing intellectual influence.

1.3 Theoretical Framework in Translation Studies

Knowledge how that means can fluctuate at some point of the translation method is crucial to the discipline of translation studies, and the notion of "semantic shifts" lies at the heart of this knowledge. It is viable for such adjustments to take place as a end result of cultural differences, variations in language, or the special perspective of the translator. Catford (1965) specifies two basic varieties of shifts: level shifts, in which which means flows between grammatical and lexical forms, and class shifts, which entail adjustments in structure, class, or unit. Both of these sorts of shifts are described as ranges of change. After some time had passed, Vinay and Darbelnet (1995) careworn the significance of modulation in keeping the forte and naturalness of a translation. In a comparable vein, the micro- and macro-structural model developed through Van Leuven-Zwart illustrates how these modifications can no longer solely alter the which means of a literary piece, but additionally the tone and the emotional affect that it has on the reader.

It is also viable for translations produced by means of synthetic Genius to endure similar adjustments from time to time. Rather than focusing on a complete grasp of the context, artificial intelligence translation systems matter on probabilistic algorithms that supply statistical sample detection the easiest priority. It is vital to note that whilst AI-based translation systems are rapid and fluent, they may skip refined cultural and interpretive features. This illustrates both the strengths and boundaries of AI-based translation. The contemporary research provides a strong conceptual framework for the purpose of investigating the approaches in which that means evolves and changes inside translated texts. This is performed by using combining classical translation idea with translation fashions pushed by synthetic talent.

1.4 Problem Statement

Large Language Models (LLMs) have modified Machine Translation (MT), which has reached a critical stage. Artificial intelligence is high quality at writing technical and enterprise texts, whilst digital linguistics struggles most with Sufi-philosophical poetry like Allama Iqbal's. Iqbal's *Jawab-i-Shikwa* is more than poetry; it's a rhythmic dialog between God and a believer that uses important Islamic terminology like *ishq*, *khudi*, and *tawhid*.

Conventional AI translation algorithms prioritize statistical likelihood above religious or emotional sensibility. Artificial intelligence often experiences "semantic flattening" when given tough texts like *Jawab-i-Shikwa*. The first English translation of the Urdu bait erases its figurative and symbolic meaning. Because of this, the text is less effective for teaching and rhetoric. Different opinions arise because functional equivalent refers to word meaning, whereas dynamic equivalence pertains to word emotion.

High-register, non-Western philosophical poetry has gotten less critical attention than an increasing corpus of work on Machine Translation (MT) in connection to Western literary canons and technical documentation. Unlike the growing body of MT research. Scholars have

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

neglected Iqbal's theological lexicons. Artificial intelligence (AI) struggles to understand Persian-Arabic words like *Faqr* and *Ishq* because there are no English counterparts. Academics like A.J. Arberry or Khushwant Singh have created "insider" human translations with cultural resonances. The "outsider" conclusions of probability-based algorithms reveal little about the depth. The digital environment can sometimes impair *Jawab-i-Shikwa's* Sanhat (poetic skill) and expressive prosody. The impassioned, oratory tone of Iqbal's vision is diminished. In the age of artificial intelligence, academics have not fully mapped the "semantic drift" that occurs when artificial intelligence bridges 20th-century Eastern pan-Islamist philosophy with 21st-century Western linguistic datasets, leaving Iqbal's metaphysical depth unexplored. This is because scholars have not yet done this.

This research suggests using a Comparative Semantic Mapping (CSM) framework, a multi-layered analytical tool that bridges algorithmic processing and humanistic interpretation, to address these disparities. The project will start by isolating *Jawab-i-Shikwa* stanzas and using current human scholarly translations to determine where AI results diverge from the poet's theological meaning. Seeking semantic deviations will be done.

Based on this categorization, the research will analyze tone using "emotional fidelity" and "philosophical accuracy" to indicate creative loss. This classification will assess artistic loss. In conclusion, this research investigates if "context-aware" inputs, which give the artificial intelligence the historical and philosophical backdrop of the poetry, can reduce semantic drift to improve prompting tactics. Finally, this methodology develops a diagnostic roadmap to improve artificial intelligence's ability to handle high-register literary translations without compromising the "spirit" of the text to maximize machine efficiency.

1.5 Objectives of the Study

I. To investigate the effects of generative AI systems on the semantic representation of *Jawab-i-Shikwa* in its English translations.

II. To identify and analyse the differences between human-written and AI-generated English translations of *Jawab-i-Shikwa* in terms of tone, semantic equivalence, and interpretive meaning

1.6 Research Questions

I. How have changes in meaning and generative AI systems affected the English versions of "Jawab-i-Shikwa"?

II. What are the differences between the human-written and AI-generated versions of "Jawab-i-Shikwa" in terms of tone, meaning, and what it means?

1.7 Delimitations

Our study can do a more thorough and accurate analysis because it only looks at translations into English. We won't be going over the complete *Bang-e-Dara* collection; instead, we'll be concentrate on *Jawab-i-Shikwa*. The comparison doesn't include either the GPT-4 translations or Khalil's version. It also doesn't include the usage of real-time AI involvement or human post-editing. As a result of the fact that the purpose of this examination is limited to semantic analysis, these phonological qualities, which include rhyme, rhythm, and sound patterns, are not taken into consideration in this study.

1.8 Significance of the Study

The purpose of this research is to integrate computational linguistics with translation research and to furnish genuine records concerning the constraints of synthetic brain in the studying and interpretation of literary works. It is possible that the findings of this study will lead to upgrades in synthetic intelligence systems, specifically in phrases of lowering the quantity of interpretive

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

bias and making South Asian poetry greater available to readers. This study no longer solely underlines the importance of conserving Iqbal's mental heritage within the Muslim community, but it additionally reaffirms the continuous relevance of Iqbal's ideas in the present world. In addition, it brings to mild the significance of inclusive records illustration and provides aid for the establishment of moral frameworks for synthetic intelligence inside the realm of digital humanities. These findings have large pedagogical implications for tutorial publications that focal point on synthetic talent as nicely as literature, and they expose new techniques to significantly have interaction with science in the context of cross-cultural communication. To summarize, the research, which was performed as part of an MPhil thesis, makes a contribution to the creation of hybrid translation fashions through combining current developments with extra conventional theoretical techniques.

2. Literature Review

The basis of this lookup is a conceptual framework that integrates more than a few fields of study, which includes translation studies, theories of semantic transformation, and artificial intelligence-assisting language processing. Translation is seen as an interpretive action in which which means is negotiated alternatively than passively conveyed from one language to another. This is the approach that is taken into consideration. This aspect of view is particularly pertinent to *Jawab-i-Shikwa*, which is a work that is ample in theological, philosophical, and poetic discourse. In a piece of writing like this, semantic range is no longer only unavoidable however additionally crucial from an analytical standpoint, because of the problematic linguistic and mental shape of the text.

2.1 Semantic Shift and Meaning Dynamics

For a considerable amount of time, the primary focus of research on semantic shift has been on the diachronic lexical change that occurs within monolingual corpora. Modern theoretical frameworks, on the other hand, are beginning to recognize that meaning is culturally dependent and context-dependent. Periti's (2024) incremental model of semantic shift detection reframes meaning as a dynamic concept that is constantly fine-tuned by context. This is done in order to better understand the meaning of the word. There is the possibility that this paradigm, which has its origins in diachronic corpora, could be utilized in translation analysis, which takes into consideration the ways in which different cultural, ideological, and linguistic contexts modify meaning. It is possible that semantic changes in translated texts will not emerge spontaneously over time due to the fact that human and machine interpretative agents impose different cognitive and algorithmic limitations.

According to those who advocate for socio-cognitive theories of meaning, the construction of semantics is influenced by a variety of factors, including mind, language, and culture. For this reason, semantic mapping has the potential to be a theoretically acceptable method of analyzing *Jawab-i-Shikwa*. Changes in meaning may indicate different interpretations of rhetorical position, theological concepts, and metaphysical pictures.

2.2 Translation as Interpretation and Semantic Negotiation

Over the course of a substantial amount of time, transposal theory struggled to answer the question of what equivalence actually is. While the functional equivalence approach lays more of an emphasis on meaning and reader reaction, the formal equivalence approach places more of an emphasis on structural similarities. Nida's functionalist model remains theoretically significant when analyzing the manner in which translations negotiate semantic meaning rather than duplicating form (Mustafa, 2018). It has been established that literal translation is incapable of catching the multi-layered meanings that are included in metaphor, symbolism, and intertextual reference. This is the outcome of persistent research in the field of poetry translation, which has shown that literal translation is unable to capture these meanings.

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

It is anticipated of translators that they will delve into the profound ideological and semantic structures of the material that they are translating, as stated by hermeneutic theory, which expands the concept of translation as interpretation. In accordance with the assertions made by Mustafa (2025), the process of translating poetry requires one to delve into complicated semantic frameworks, in addition to metaphor, allegory, and semantic ambiguity, beginning with the level of surface-level language forms. The poetic voice of *Jawab-i-Shikwa* is characterised by a seamless convergence of divine address, historical reference, and moral admonition. This is one of the motives why this structure works specifically well with *Jawab-i-Shikwa*.

2.3 Human Translators as Cultural and Theological Mediators

Human translators, in their characteristic as cultural mediators, actively interpret which means by drawing on their personal cultural, theological, and historical appreciation at some point of the translation process. According to Anjrawati (2024), lookup on poetic and lyrical translation displays how purposeful semantic alteration can make the text extra approachable and emotionally resonant for the humans who are anticipated to examine it. In accordance with the theory, these changes to that means are no longer considered to be distortions; rather, they are interpretive methods that make an effort to preserve the pragmatic and emotional meaning of the original text.

Within the realm of poetry that is steeped in religious traditions, there is a similarly development in the feature of the mediator. In the context of engaging with ethical injunctions, divine characteristics, and theological lexicon, it is of the utmost importance to apply an interpretive sensitivity that goes properly beyond the easy substitution of words. The deliberate semantic adjustments that take place as a result of human translators putting a higher cost on reverence, rhetorical effect, or doctrinal readability are more suggestive of interpretive judgement than they are of error. This is due to the fact these changes are made in order to ensure that the meaning of the text is conveyed accurately.

2.4 AI-Generated Translation and Algorithmic Semantics

A unique approach to the technology of meaning has emerged as a end result of current breakthroughs in neural laptop translation and large language models. This technique has been given the title "big language modeling." In contrast, translations are produced by using artificial Genius structures through the system of getting to know probabilistic patterns from large corpora. This is in distinction to the traditional method of relying on human interpretive intent. The results of a recent study (Farahani, 2024) have shown that translations produced by artificial intelligence (AI) are particularly suitable for texts that include information. On the other hand, the ability of such translations to effectively engage with texts that are ideologically anchored or marked by considerable semantic density is still a source of ongoing discussion among the academic community. When presented with specialized subject areas, generative models like as GPT-4 still fall significantly short of expert proficiency (Martikainen et al., 2025). This is despite the fact that these models display performance that is comparable to that of novice human translators. There is a significant gap between the two types of translators. Because this suggests that AI systems are great at superficial semantic alignment but not so great at deep semantic interpretation, it is especially problematic when dealing with religious, cultural, or rhetorical nuances. This is because it implies AI systems are strong at superficial semantic alignment.

Moreover, translations that are generated by artificial intelligence have a propensity to be statistically centralized and literalistic, which results in outcomes that are semantically "safe" and have little variation from the established norm. Especially touchy to this tendency, which can end result in a delicate knocking down of semantics, are texts such as *Jawab-i-Shikwa*,

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

which region a massive emphasis on the force of rhetoric and the non secular depth of their meaning. As a result, these texts are in particular vulnerable to this tendency.

2.5 Evaluating Semantic Shifts in Human and AI Translation

Interpretive and comparative frameworks are being employed in vicinity of metric-based contrast in theoretical fashions of translation quality. Metric-based comparison is no longer being used. According to Hiebl et al. (2024), human-centered assessment and scaling methodologies supply relative semantic desire a higher priority than absolute accuracy. In contrast to this, methodologies that location an emphasis on absolute correctness are not being used. Due to the reality that these methods take into account the opportunity that unique translations can have distinct meanings, they are theoretically appropriate for mapping adjustments in meaning. This is due to the fact they take into account the opportunity that one of a kind translations can be right from a semantic standpoint, however they can also have one-of-a-kind interpretations.

According to the concept that serves as the foundation for the semantic shift mapping that is presented in this work, the disparities that exist between translations done through humans and these finished by way of artificial talent are indicative of essential differences in the tactics by which which means is generated. Any modifications in semantic which means are not regarded to be defects in this context; rather, they are believed to be markers of the cognitive modeling processes that lie in the back of the surface, the computational restrictions that are present, and the interpretative strategies that are utilized all through the translation procedure.

2.6 Toward a Hybrid Theoretical Paradigm

A hybrid paradigm, in which translation is understood as a collaborative effort between human and machine agents, is becoming increasingly prevalent in current research. This has led to an increase in the orientation of theoretical discourse toward this hybrid paradigm. According to Intento (2024) and Marshall (2024), activities such as cultural mediation, ethical judgment, and interpretation continue to require the assistance of human translators. Despite the fact that artificial intelligence (AI) helps make translation more accessible and efficient, it does not completely eliminate the need for human translators. The purpose of this study is to demonstrate how semantic shift analysis can show systematic differences between human translations and translations produced by artificial intelligence at the level of meaning production. Specifically, this study extends that theoretical approach by demonstrating how semantic shift analysis can expose these differences.

In the current study, *Jawab-i-Shikwa* is used as a benchmark for the aim of putting hypotheses concerning AI-mediated language processing, translation equivalency, and semantic shift to the test. As a result of algorithmic generalization and statistical modeling, changes in translations produced by artificial intelligence are more likely to be the result of these two processes, according to a theoretical study. On the other hand, versions in translations that are produced via people are a signal of the diploma of interpretative perception and cultural awareness, respectively. Keeping tune of these developments may not solely provide guidelines related to the exceptional of translation, but it can also provide perception into the growing interaction between human and synthetic brain cognition and meaning-making. Early lookup on semantic representation lay the framework for enduring issues that continue to have an effect on the layout and growth of current linguistic and translation systems. These challenges proceed to have each a high-quality and poor impact. The analytical precision of structured semantic annotation frameworks, in unique Object–Subject–Predicate models, is one of the elements that is contributing to the improved use of these frameworks. On the other hand, as Andrews et al. (2012) factor out, the intrinsic complexity of these structures regularly restricts accessibility for customers who are now not educated in the problem matter. This highlights the ongoing warfare that exists between technological sophistication and interpretability.

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

Within the context of current language functions pushed by way of synthetic intelligence, this tension continues to be of remarkable significance, highlighting the ongoing importance of hanging a stability between computational rigor and human-centered usability standards.

Poetry and different types of innovative writing, in particular, have been receiving a increased level of interest from lecturers ever seeing that the yr 2023 in particular. Studies that had been conducted at some stage in this time length always mean that poetic translation is the most difficult concern to translate due to the truth that it lays a full-size emphasis on metaphor, rhythm, emotional resonance, and cultural symbolism (Studies of Poetic Translation, 2023–2025). Formal equivalency is now not enough for translation in creative genres; rather, translation need to interact in a deep interplay with the cultural and contextual meaning of the source material. This is due to the fact translation is based on the source material. This comprehension is necessary for the ideal completion of the translation process. It is by means of these findings that an extra piece of evidence is in desire of the notion that translation is required in all varieties of creative artistic expression.

A massive methodological enchancment in the modeling of that means evolution has been made feasible by way of the use of an incremental method to the identification of semantic alterations. The WiDiD framework was once added by using Periti (2024), which conceptualizes the which means of phrases as a phenomenon that is always evolving alternatively than a evaluation that is static across severa temporal snapshots. Taking into consideration this paradigm, it would show up that the that means of phrases is a phenomena that is in a country of regular change. This method, which makes use of evolutionary clustering of contextualized word embeddings, is utilized due to the fact it is well matched with cutting-edge concepts of meaning, which declare that meaning is something that is both dynamic and socially situated. This technique is utilized because it is like-minded with these modern-day notions of meaning. A candidate is currently being sought after by way of the tutorial subject of translation research in order to fill this job, which is becoming an an increasing number of indispensable one.

The thought that human translation is always foremost to computer translation in every state of affairs was once called into question by authentic lookup that commenced to be carried out parallel with the aforementioned time length for the motive of placing the idea into doubt. When the degree of sufficiency of machine-generated translations from Persian to English was once reviewed against expert literature, it was once located that the degree of adequacy completed via laptop translations was once similar to that of human translations. According to the findings of the evaluation of sufficiency, which used to be conducted by Farahani (2024), it was once decided that machine translation is capable of developing translations that are functionally desirable for both informational and non-literary content material when semantic alignment is prioritized over stylistic refinement. Taking into consideration the practical implications of these findings, it appears that translations generated by using machines are capable of achieving splendid practical equivalency.

In addition, studies that investigate the interpretive function of translators shed light on the fact that they take on the role of cultural mediators during the translation process. Anjrawati (2024) made the observation that the incorporation of semantic changes and expansions in the translation of musical and lyrical texts frequently results in an increase in the audience's emotional accessibility and involvement. The significance of the active role that translators play in modifying meaning in order to conform to the cultural and linguistic sensibilities of the audience that is being translated is highlighted by this.

In order to provide a holistic perspective on the capabilities and limitations of artificial intelligence in translation, the purpose of this comprehensive review, which spans four decades of research, was to provide a synthesis of these insights and provide a holistic perspective on

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

the capabilities and limitations of AI in translation. This review also offered valuable implications for both academic research and industry practice. As an additional point of interest, Intento (2022024) noted the ongoing difficulties that are connected to low-resource languages, dialectal variation, ethical accountability, and cultural sensitivity. This was done in addition to tracking the transition from rule-based and statistical systems to neural and generative models. An further contribution that was given by Intento was the identification of potential solutions to the problems that were being experienced. Within the confines of this investigation, the most recent technological advancements are positioned inside a framework that is founded on critical analysis and historical research.

Furthermore, there has been a substantial amount of progress achieved in the methods that are utilized in the process of evaluating the quality of translations. When Hiebl and his colleagues were looking for a quick and reliable replacement to the traditional techniques of evaluation in the year 2024, they came up with the concept of Best–Worst Scaling. This was done in order to find a solution to their problem. However, the findings of their research suggested that human translations were continuously preferred. This was the case despite the fact that advanced machine translation systems, in particular DeepL, performed at a level that was comparable to that of other systems. The adoption of this strategy results in the construction of evaluation methods that are more focused on the concerns of individuals and that are also scalable.

The introduction of comparison evaluations of human and machine translation was an important contributor to the development of this discourse, which was further developed as a result of this introduction. According to Marshall (2024), human translators are still necessary for works that are culturally sensitive, imaginative, and high-stakes. He came to this conclusion by conducting research. Despite the fact that machine translation provides considerable benefits in terms of speed and cost efficiency, this is the situation that presently exists. There is nevertheless a need for human translators for these types of tasks, in spite of the fact that computing device translation presents a variety of primary benefits. After finishing their examination, the researchers came to the awareness that hybrid translation models are indispensable to use because they mix the effectiveness of computer systems with the interpretative talents of people. The findings from this find out about spotlight how severely necessary they are. The empirical statistics that was once gathered from the range of institutional contexts that have been investigated in this study supplied extra clarification of these conclusions. An instance of this would be the investigation that Martikainen and colleagues (2025) carried out exploring the incorporation of GPT-4 into a public healthcare translation service. Through their research, they have been in a position to establish that post-editing techniques led to extensive will increase in productivity. According to Martikainen et al. (2025), the first-class of the translation consequences was affected via a range of factors, consisting of the expert ability of the translators themselves, the structure of the workflow, and the level of training that the organization had. Despite this, there was a huge amount of diversity in overall performance amongst translators, which introduced to light the heterogeneity of the results. In spite of this, the excellent of the results was once affected through the person understanding of every participant.

It is when it comes to industries that require an excessive level of creativity and expertise that the limitations of laptop translation emerge as particularly obvious. The author Mustafa (2025) believes that in order to be profitable in translating poetry, one should have a profound connection with metaphor, allegory, and semantic ambiguity. As a end result of the reality that this is the case, translation is located within the context of an interpretive act rather than a technique that is mechanical in nature. In a comparable vein, Lu et al. (2025) discovered that despite the fact that GPT-4 finished exact ratings in translating patient-reported result measures,

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

human translators continue to be quintessential for making sure that clinical verbal exchange is both contextually accurate and ethically acceptable. This is due to the fact that human translators are able to translate the results that are mentioned by patients. This is yet any other discovery that Lu and his colleagues discovered all through the path of their work.

The panorama of language has undergone substantial adjustments as a result of tendencies in annotation and discourse analysis, which have prompted extra consequential changes in fields that are associated to the study of language. Karim et al. (2025) made the discovery that LLM-driven annotation dealers drastically enhance scalability and consistency, while at the same time drawing attention to imperative moral concerns with prejudice and transparency. An strategy acknowledged as functional discourse annotation was applied through Fernández-Cruz (2025) in the procedure of assessing editorials that have been contained inside monetary opinion publications. In spite of issues such as sarcasm and evaluative gradience, the methodology successfully achieved an excessive stage of correlation between the annotations of more than a few individuals. This was once accomplished in spite of the reality that there have been drawbacks. The work that has previously been done, as nicely as the activities that have been carried out in the past, include this study, which is a supplement to the work that has already been done.

Even while generative fashions are developing closer to the performance of junior human translators, a full assessment analysis located that they are no longer but capable to suit the know-how of experienced professionals. The effects of Martikainen et al. (2025) indicate that GPT-4 shows performance that is similar to that of junior human translators. However, the effectiveness of GPT-4 decreases in specialized fields and in language pairs that have restrained resources. A conclusion that is supported by way of empirical statistics from the find out about is that the best characteristic for synthetic Genius in translation is not as an independent agent however alternatively as a collaborative associate working alongside human translators. These findings lend help to the notion that this is the most advantageous position for AI in translation operations.

3. Research Methodology

3.1 Research Paradigm

This thesis for a Master of Philosophy degree (Creswell & Poth, 2018) is based totally on the interpretivist paradigm, which says that the foremost variables that structure an individual's perspective of the world are the individual's own perceptions and experiences. It has been pointed out by Bassnett (2014) that this methodology is specifically appropriate for lookup in the area of translation studies. This is due to the fact literary writings are deeply anchored in the stipulations of their person cultural, historical, and technological settings. There is no such aspect as that means that is inherent in translation; rather, meaning is some thing that emerges by the interaction between the supply textual content and the translator, regardless of whether the translator is a human or an synthetic intelligence. According to Gadamer (1975), hermeneutic traditions outline translation as a relationship that is together high-quality between texts and the occasions in which they are discovered. The role of the researcher, from the viewpoint of the interpretivist school of thought, is now not to look for frequent or absolute truths; rather, it is to discover, interpret, and give an explanation for the various levels of meaning that are present.

3.2 Research Design

The study adopts a qualitative comparative research design, augmented by computational textual analysis. This design facilitates a nuanced juxtaposition of human and AI translation outputs. By isolating specific stanzas from *Jawab-i-Shikwa*, the research maps the semantic trajectories undertaken by M.A.K. Khalil and GPT-4. The comparative design is inherently interpretive, allowing the researcher to delve into the "why" and "how" of semantic shifts rather

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

than merely quantifying them. This aligns with the overarching aim of assessing not just linguistic accuracy, but emotional fidelity and cultural manifestation. The research design proceeds in three phases: first, the extraction and codification of key stanzas; second, the generation of AI translations and retrieval of Khalil's published translations; and third, the application of the Comparative Semantic Mapping (CSM) framework to evaluate shifts against Baker's Translation Universals.

3.3 Research Approach

The which means of *Jawab-i-Shikwa* has been impacted via translations, and this thesis explores how these translations have occurred. In accordance with Denzin and Lincoln (2017), the research is ordinarily primarily based on qualitative approaches that are based on interpretive analysis. These methodologies are particularly well-suited for the find out about of literature because they make it feasible to habits an in-depth investigation of textual nuances, which quantitative methods alone might miss. Making comparisons between translations made via humans and those produced by way of synthetic Genius lets in for the identification of patterns in the manner of meaning-making.

The research is based totally on hermeneutic theory, which was once developed by Ricoeur in 1981. This principle considers translation to be an interpretative procedure that is naturally impacted by way of contextual instances and technical impacts. Quantitative methods, such as computational metrics, are a beneficial complement to qualitative evaluation when you consider that they enhance the reliability and validity of interpretative judgments. A comprehensive framework for facts analysis is supplied with the aid of mixed-methods approaches, as Teddlie and Tashakkori (2009) factor out. This hybrid methodology is especially beneficial for managing big textual datasets because it combines numerical measures with nuanced human interpretation. This is an integration that solely qualitative techniques frequently locate challenging to accomplish.

3.4 Theoretical Framework

Within the scope of this thesis, an examination is provided of the methods in which translations of *Jawab-i-Shikwa* have influenced the semantic which means of the text. The theoretical framework integrates J.C. Catford's (1965) shift model, Vinay and Darbelnet's (1995) modulation equivalence, and predominantly, Mona Baker's (1993, 1996) Translation Universals. These universals provide the diagnostic lens through which semantic drift and algorithmic literalism are assessed. Baker's universals—simplification, explicitation, normalization, levelling out, avoidance of repetition, and translationese—serve as the primary categorical tools to dissect how human and AI translators negotiate the profound theological lexicon and rhetorical structures of Iqbal's poetry. By mapping the outputs of GPT-4 and Khalil onto these universals, the study systematically identifies where algorithmic processing results in semantic flattening and where human interpretive judgment preserves philosophical accuracy and emotional fidelity.

3.5 Mona Baker's Translation Universals

Translated texts usually have the same traits as non-translated texts, no matter what language pair or translator is used (1993, 1996). All of these things are called translation universals. These are more like trends that crop up in translations than rules. A straightforward and succinct explanation of the main universals as applied to this study is as follows:

1. Simplification

To simplify the material, translators often use shorter phrases, reduce the use of metaphorical language, and use clearer and more straightforward structures.

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

Relevance to your course of study: Find out if the analogies, rhetorical questions, and pictures used by Iqbal in *Jawab-i-Shikwa* are better understood through Khalil's translation or GPT-4. AI models, driven by probabilistic fluency, frequently simplify opaque metaphors into literal prose, thereby stripping the text of its mystical resonance. For instance, the complex metaphor of the "moth and the candle" (*parwana aur shama*) might be simplified by AI into a mere statement of attraction, whereas a human translator might preserve the layered Sufi allegory of divine longing.

2. Explicitation

Translators often make implicit information explicit in the target text, inserting explanatory clauses or parenthetical additions to ensure reader comprehension.

Relevance to your course of study: Khalil frequently employs explicitation by introducing footnotes or bracketed historical and theological contexts (e.g., explaining the significance of the Battle of Badr or the term *tawhid*). GPT-4, conversely, may either omit these cultural markers entirely—assuming a universal, decontextualized reader—or insert clunky, algorithmically generated over-explanations that disrupt the poetic flow. The study investigates how each translator balances the implicit richness of Iqbal's Urdu with the explicit demands of English readability.

3. Normalization / Conservatism

Normalization involves conforming to the typical patterns and grammatical structures of the target language, often at the expense of the source text's idiosyncratic syntax.

Relevance to your course of study: Iqbal's Urdu syntax is highly involuted, often placing the verb or the object in emphatic positions that defy standard English word order. GPT-4 heavily normalizes these inversions into standard Subject-Verb-Object (SVO) English structures, resulting in grammatically correct but rhetorically neutered verses. Khalil, conversely, may conservatively maintain the archaic or inverted syntax to mirror Iqbal's rhetorical emphasis, resisting the pull of target-language normalization to preserve the source's structural "spirit."

4. Levelling Out

Translators refrain from taking things to an extreme, such as reducing stylistic variation, avoiding too sentimental or stuffy language, and levelling off the register.

Relevance to your course of study: *Jawab-i-Shikwa* is characterized by extreme stylistic oscillations—ranging from the ecstatic, elevated discourse of divine address to the sorrowful, intimate censure of the human speaker. AI demonstrates a strong tendency to level out these register shifts, smoothing the ecstatic highs and melancholic lows into a uniform, middle-brow, conversational English tone. This study examines whether AI does a better job than Khalil of balancing Iqbal's registers, or if such levelling inherently destroys the text's emotional dynamism.

5. Avoidance of Repetition

Even when the original language makes extensive use of a single word for symbolic or rhetorical reasons, translators typically avoid doing likewise, opting for synonym variation instead.

Relevance to your course of study: Words like *Shikwa* (complaint), *Jawab* (answer), *ham* (we), and *tu* (you) are repetitions that Iqbal intentionally uses to build rhetorical crescendo and establish the dialectical tension of the poem. AI, programmed to value lexical diversity, might replace these intentional repetitions with a variety of English synonyms (e.g., "grievance," "lament," "reply," "response"), thereby fracturing the leitmotif. Khalil is more likely to retain the repetition to honor the poem's structural and thematic unity.

6. Translationese

It is possible for translated writings to exhibit traits more typical of translated speech than of natural language, such as unusual phrase buildings or synthetic collocations.

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

Relevance to your course of study: On rare occasions, AI translations may employ "machine translationese"—a distinct flavor of output that is grammatically flawless and lexically accurate but culturally hollow, lacking the lived resonance of idiomatic human expression. Khalil's "human translationese," while occasionally archaic or stilted, carries the warmth of cultural insider-ship. This universal helps categorize the "otherness" of the translated text—whether it feels like a culturally mediated bridge or a sterile linguistic transplant.

One of the most vital universals is simplifying texts so they are easier to read. Shorter sentences, less metaphor, and greater every day phrases are all approaches this simplification could take place (Baker, 1996). Simplifying a complicated piece of poetry like *Jawab-i-Shikwa* might weaken its rhetorical have an effect on and which means when translated. By applying these six universals, this study constructs a rigorous diagnostic grid to evaluate the semantic shifts in both human and AI translations of Iqbal's masterpiece.

4. Data Analysis and Discussion

This chapter applies the Comparative Semantic Mapping (CSM) framework, underpinned by Mona Baker's Translation Universals, to analyze selected stanzas from *Jawab-i-Shikwa*. By juxtaposing the original Urdu (transliterated), M.A.K. Khalil's human translation, and the output generated by GPT-4, the analysis traces the semantic shifts that occur when profound Sufi-philosophical poetry is mediated by human interpretive judgment versus algorithmic probability. The analysis is structured around key thematic and linguistic nodes: theological lexicon, metaphor and allegory, rhetorical syntax, and register dynamics.

4.1 The Translation of Theological Lexicon: *Ishq*, *Khudi*, and *Tawhid*

The most formidable challenge in translating Iqbal lies in rendering his highly specialized theological lexicon. Terms like *Ishq* (passionate, divine love), *Khudi* (selfhood/ego), and *Tawhid* (divine unity) possess dense intertextual histories within Islamic mysticism and philosophy, lacking direct equivalents in standard English.

Stanza Analysis 1: The Concept of *Ishq*
Original Urdu (Transliterated):
Ishq hai un ke faqr ka dastaar-baaf
Ishq hai un ke martaaba-haaf
Ishq ki taudeed se paida hai lauh-o-qalam
Ishq ki taudeed se zinda hai yak-qadam

Khalil's Translation:
Love it is that weaves the turban of their poverty;
Love it is that guards their exalted rank;
From the revelation of Love are born the Tablet and the Pen;
From the revelation of Love springs one step of life.

GPT-4 Translation:
Passion weaves the turban of their poverty,
Passion protects their high status,
From the declaration of passion, the tablet and pen are created,
From the declaration of passion, one step comes to life.
Comparative Semantic Mapping:
The Urdu word *Ishq* denotes an intense, all-consuming, often annihilative divine love that transcends rationality. Khalil elects to translate *Ishq* as "Love," capitalizing the "L." This is a deliberate act of **explicitation** and functional equivalence; the capitalization signals to the English reader that this is not mundane romantic affection, but a proper, divine entity.

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

Furthermore, Khalil retains the anaphoric repetition of "Love it is that..." mirroring Iqbal's rhetorical buildup.

GPT-4, conversely, translates *Ishq* as "Passion." This is a profound semantic shift driven by algorithmic **simplification** and **normalization**. In Western datasets, "passion" is strongly collocated with romantic or intense emotional states, but it lacks the specific Sufi ontology of *Ishq* (which includes the annihilation of the self in the Divine). "Passion" secularizes the verse. Additionally, GPT-4 falls victim to the **avoidance of repetition** universal. While Iqbal repeats *Ishq* four times to create a rhythmic, ecstatic hammering of the concept, GPT-4 varies the surrounding syntax awkwardly ("Passion weaves... Passion protects... From the declaration of passion..."), failing to capture the poetic parallelism. Finally, GPT-4 translates *faqr* (spiritual poverty/independence from the world) as "poverty," and *martaaba* (exalted spiritual rank) as "high status." This represents severe **semantic flattening**. "Poverty" in English implies material lack, whereas *faqr* is a badge of spiritual mastery. "High status" sounds like corporate hierarchy, completely stripping the Sufi connotation of proximity to God. Khalil's "poverty" and "exalted rank," while still imperfect, are salvaged by the reverent, archaic tone of the surrounding syntax.

4.2 Metaphor and Allegory: The Moth and the Candle

Iqbal frequently employs classic Sufi metaphors, assuming an audience intimately familiar with the imagery of the *shama* (candle/divine beauty) and the *parwana* (moth/the seeking soul).

Stanza Analysis 2: The Allegory of Devotion
Original Urdu (Transliterated):
Parwana jala apni mushaqqat se raat
Qatl ho gaya lazzat-e-did se raat

Khalil's Translation:
The moth burned itself up by its own toil in the night;
It was murdered by the delight of vision in the night.

GPT-4 Translation:
The moth stayed up working hard at night and burned itself,
It was killed by the pleasure of seeing at night.

Comparative Semantic Mapping:
In Sufi tradition, the moth circling the candle until it is consumed by the flame is the ultimate allegory for *fanā* (annihilation of the ego in the divine presence). Khalil's translation employs "burned itself up," which captures the totality of the consumption. More importantly, Khalil translates *lazzat-e-did* (the ecstasy of beholding the Divine) as "delight of vision." The word "vision" here retains the mystical double-meaning: physical sight and spiritual epiphany. The use of "murdered" rather than "killed" elevates the register, introducing a sense of violent, overwhelming surrender characteristic of *Ishq*.

GPT-4's translation is a textbook example of **simplification** and **levelling out**. "Stayed up working hard at night" completely dismantles the metaphor. A moth does not "work hard"; it is drawn irresistibly to the light. The AI has literalized the effort (*mushaqqat*) into prosaic labor, entirely missing the metaphorical context of the moth's fatal attraction. Furthermore, "pleasure of seeing" reduces *lazzat-e-did* to a mundane optical event. "Pleasure" lacks the ecstatic connotation of *lazzat* in this context, and "seeing" is a flattened, literal rendering of *did*, stripped of its mystical epiphany. The AI's phrasing sounds like a

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

factual report of an insect's behavior rather than a profound spiritual allegory, demonstrating how algorithmic literalism destroys the "spirit" of the text.

4.3 Rhetorical Syntax and Emphatic Inversion

Iqbal's Urdu frequently utilizes syntactic inversion—placing the verb or the object at the beginning of the verse for dramatic emphasis. This rhetorical strategy is central to the oratorical power of *Jawab-i-Shikwa*.

Stanza Analysis 3: Divine Rebuke
Original Urdu (Transliterated):
Kya tum ne samjha hai ke qibla badalna asaan hai
Kya tum ne samjha hai ke musalman hona asaan hai

Khalil's Translation:
Did you think that changing the Qibla was easy?
Did you think that becoming a Muslim was easy?

GPT-4 Translation:
Is changing the direction of prayer something you consider easy?
Is being a Muslim something you consider simple?

Comparative Semantic Mapping:
The original Urdu uses a direct, accusatory rhetorical structure: *Kya tum ne samjha hai* (Did you think/assume). It is a piercing, confrontational syntax. Khalil preserves this aggressive, interrogative mode perfectly: "Did you think...?" He also retains the Islamic term *Qibla* (the direction of prayer, symbolizing spiritual orientation and communal identity), allowing the cultural specificity to stand.

GPT-4, driven by **normalization**, restructures the syntax into the passive, analytical format: "Is changing the direction of prayer something you consider easy?" This shifts the focus from the accusatory "you" to the gerund "changing," dramatically softening the rebuke. The divine voice in *Jawab-i-Shikwa* should be thunderous; GPT-4's voice is bureaucratic. Furthermore, GPT-4 explicitly translates *Qibla* as "direction of prayer." While this is an act of **explicitation** that makes the text immediately accessible to a non-Muslim reader, it commits semantic flattening. The *Qibla* is not merely a compass direction; it is a profound symbol of the *Ummah's* unity and the covenant with God. By reducing it to "direction of prayer," GPT-4 extracts the theological weight from the word, prioritizing informational clarity over cultural and spiritual manifestation. Finally, translating *asaan* as "simple" rather than "easy" in the second line reduces the dramatic stakes; "simple" implies a lack of complexity, whereas "easy" implies a lack of arduous struggle, which is the precise crux of Iqbal's argument—that the Muslim identity requires arduous, heroic struggle.

4.4 Register Dynamics: The Oscillation of the Divine Voice

Jawab-i-Shikwa is unique in that the speaker is God, responding to the complaints of humanity. The register oscillates between majestic, cosmic authority and intimate, sorrowful disappointment.

Stanza Analysis 4: Cosmic Grandeur vs. Intimate Sorrow
Original Urdu (Transliterated):
Sitaron pe jo chamke hai wo teri naseeb ki talashi
Zameen ki guddi mein hai teri aabroo ki faroshi

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

Khalil's Translation:
That which shines on the stars is the search for your destiny;
In the lap of the earth lies the vending of your honor!

GPT-4 Translation:
What shines on the stars is the search for your fate,
In the earth's lap, your honor is being sold.

Comparative Semantic Mapping:
Iqbal creates a stark, tragic juxtaposition between the cosmos (the stars) and the degradation of the earthly realm. Khalil captures the elevated, poetic register of the first line with "That which shines on the stars," an archaism that befits divine speech. The second line crashes down with the devastating "vending of your honor!" The word "vending" is deliberately archaic and commercial, heightening the grotesque nature of the Muslims' spiritual degradation.
GPT-4 **levels out** this register shift. "What shines on the stars" is flatter and less majestic than "That which shines." More critically, "your honor is being sold" is a passive, prosaic construction that completely neutralizes the visceral impact of *faroshi* (the act of selling away/cheapening). "Vending" or "prostitution of your honor" captures the active, shameful agency implied by the Urdu; "is being sold" makes it sound like a passive, unremarkable transaction. This exemplifies the AI's tendency toward statistical centralization: the passive voice is more common and "safe" in English informational texts, but it is rhetorically disastrous for a poem of divine reproach. The AI fails to capture the emotional fidelity of the text, prioritizing grammatical smoothness over dramatic impact.

4.5 The Accumulation of Semantic Drift: A Synthesis of Translation Universals

Across the selected stanzas, a clear pattern emerges regarding how Baker's Translation Universals manifest differently in human and AI translations. In Khalil's human translation, **explicitation** is used strategically (capitalizing "Love," retaining "Qibla" while allowing the context to imply its weight), and **simplification** is resisted in favor of preserving the metaphorical density (using "vision" instead of "seeing"). Khalil accepts the "foreignness" of the text, forcing the English reader to meet Iqbal's philosophy on its own terms. His translation is an act of cultural mediation that preserves the theological *khudi* (selfhood/essence) of the poem.
GPT-4, conversely, exhibits a systematic reliance on **simplification**, **normalization**, and **levelling out**. Complex Sufi metaphors are reduced to literal, prosaic events (the moth "working hard"). Theologically dense terms are replaced with secular, emotionally flat equivalents (*Ishq* becomes "passion," *Qibla* becomes "direction of prayer"). Rhetorical inversions are normalized into standard SVO structures, neutering the thunderous voice of the divine. This cumulative semantic drift demonstrates that GPT-4 processes *Jawab-i-Shikwa* not as a unified, philosophical work of art, but as a string of isolated lexical puzzles. It solves each puzzle by selecting the statistically most probable English equivalent, resulting in a text that is informationally transparent but spiritually and emotionally hollow.
The analysis validates the problem statement: without the lived experience of cultural and theological "insider-ship," AI is constrained to algorithmic literalism. It can tell you what the words mean, but it cannot perform the meaning. The "spirit" of Iqbal's text—its ecstatic longing, its bitter reproach, its cosmic grandeur—is precisely what is lost when translation is reduced to probabilistic mapping.

5. Conclusion

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

This study set out to investigate the semantic shifts that occur when translating Allama Iqbal's *Jawab-i-Shikwa*, juxtaposing the nuanced, culturally mediated human translation of M.A.K. Khalil with the algorithmically generated output of GPT-4. Grounded in Mona Baker's Translation Universals and a Comparative Semantic Mapping (CSM) framework, the research has mapped the profound differences between human interpretive judgment and machine probabilistic literalism in the context of high-register Sufi-philosophical poetry.

Addressing the first research question—*How have changes in meaning and generative AI systems affected the English versions of "Jawab-i-Shikwa"?*—the findings reveal that generative AI systems fundamentally alter the semantic landscape of the poem through systematic semantic flattening. By prioritizing statistical likelihood and target-language fluency, AI algorithms strip the text of its theological density and cultural specificity. Complex, polysemous terms like *Ishq* and *Faqr* are reduced to their most common, secular English equivalents ("passion" and "poverty"), erasing centuries of Sufi metaphysical philosophy embedded within them. The changes in meaning are not merely lexical substitutions; they are ideological shifts that secularize and democratize a text whose very power lies in its exclusivity, spiritual hierarchy, and divine orientation.

Addressing the second research question—*What are the difference between the human-written and AI-generated versions of "Jawab-i-Shikwa" in terms of tone, meaning, and what it means?*—the study demonstrates that the differences are foundational. In terms of tone, Khalil's human translation preserves the ecstatic, reproachful, and majestic oscillations of Iqbal's divine voice. It captures the rhetoric of the *shikwa* (complaint) and the *jawab* (answer) by maintaining emphatic repetitions and archaic, elevated registers. GPT-4, in contrast, levels out these tonal extremes into a uniform, middle-brow, conversational tone, resulting in a rhetorical neutering of the divine address. In terms of meaning, Khalil engages in functional equivalence, making deliberate interpretive choices (like capitalizing "Love" or using "vision") to preserve the poem's deeper spiritual significance. GPT-4 engages in formal equivalence at the lexical level but fails at the hermeneutic level, delivering a literal yet hollow rendering. Consequently, "what it means"—the philosophical essence and cultural manifestation of the poem—is retained in the human translation through acts of cultural mediation, while the AI translation reduces "what it means" to a mere surface-level proposition, devoid of lived spiritual resonance.

Fulfilling the study's objectives, the research has traced how meaning changes by utilizing generative AI models like GPT-4 alongside M.A.K. Khalil's translation, demonstrating that AI imposes a distinct algorithmic translational regime characterized by simplification, normalization, and avoidance of repetition. Step two—seeing how these changes altered the tone, the ability to keep the message, and the reality of the cultural manifestation—revealed that AI's semantic shifts severely compromise the text's rhetorical force, emotional fidelity, and cultural authenticity. Finally, these goals make AI better by making it easier to do extensive evaluations, providing a diagnostic roadmap (the CSM framework) that highlights exactly where and why algorithmic literalism fails, thus informing future prompt engineering and the development of context-aware AI translation models.

The theoretical implications of this study underscore that translation is an inherently hermeneutic act. The preservation of a text's "spirit" over its "structure" requires an interpretive agency that current Large Language Models do not possess. LLMs lack a "world"—a lived experience of faith, cultural marginalization, or ecstatic longing—from which to draw interpretive relevance. Therefore, while they can simulate semantic alignment, they cannot simulate semantic depth. The pedagogical and practical implications are clear: in the realm of digital humanities and the translation of culturally sacred or philosophically dense texts, AI must be positioned not as an autonomous translator, but as a collaborative partner. Hybrid

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

translation models, where AI provides initial drafts and human translators perform the crucial hermeneutic, cultural, and emotional calibrations, are the most ethical and effective path forward.

While this study provides a rigorous comparative framework, it is delimited to a single poem and a single human translator. Future research should expand this Comparative Semantic Mapping to other poems within *Bang-e-Dara* and across different human translators (such as A.J. Arberry or Khushwant Singh) to determine whether the semantic flattening observed in GPT-4 is universal to AI translation or specific to this text-model pairing. Furthermore, empirical reception studies involving Muslim and non-Muslim readers could provide valuable data on how AI-induced semantic flattening actually impacts reader comprehension and spiritual engagement. Finally, as suggested in the problem statement, future inquiries should test "context-aware" prompting strategies—feeding the AI the historical and philosophical context of *Jawab-i-Shikwa* prior to translation—to assess whether algorithmic semantic drift can be computationally mitigated, pushing the boundaries of what artificial intelligence can achieve in the delicate art of bridging not just languages, but worlds.

References

Ali, A., & Hussien, A. (2018). The Islamic concept of Tawhid and its impact on the Muslim community. Journal of Islamic Philosophy, 4(2), 45–60.

Andrews, A., Fossati, D., & Katz, B. (2012). Structured semantic annotation for intelligent language interfaces. Proceedings of the ACL, 45–56.

Anim, M. (2024). Rhetorical strategies in Allama Iqbal's poetry. Iqbal Academy.

Anjrawati, A. (2024). Semantic alteration and emotional accessibility in lyrical translation. Translation Studies Quarterly, 21(3), 112–128.

Anjum, F. (2016). Translating classical Urdu poetry: Theological and cultural engagements. Oxford University Press.

Azad, A. (2014). Iqbal: The concept of Khudi and modern existentialism. National Book Foundation.

Baker, M. (1993). Corpus linguistics and translation studies: Implications and applications. In M. Baker, G. Francis, & E. Tognini-Bonelli (Eds.), Text and technology (pp. 233–250). John Benjamins.

Baker, M. (1996). Corpus-based approaches to translation studies: An overview. Meta, 41(4), 512–525.

Bassnett, S. (2014). Translation studies (4th ed.). Routledge.

Britannica, E. (2024). Indian Rebellion (1857). In Encyclopædia Britannica.

Catford, J. C. (1965). A linguistic theory of translation. Oxford University Press.

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches (4th ed.). SAGE.

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2017). The SAGE handbook of qualitative research (5th ed.). SAGE.

Farahani, M. B. (2024). Sufficiency of machine-generated Persian-to-English translations. Journal of Translation and Interpreting, 19(1), 88–104.

Fernández-Cruz, A. (2025). Functional discourse annotation in financial opinion texts. Discourse Processes, 62(1), 33–48.

Gadamer, H. G. (1975). Truth and method. Sheed & Ward.

Gesnot, D. (2025). AI and the human capabilities conundrum in language processing. AI & Society, 40(1), 15–28.

Hiebl, S., et al. (2024). Best–worst scaling for translation quality evaluation. Proceedings of LREC, 220–235.

ISSN E: 3006-1466
ISSN P: 3006-1458
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
CJSSR
CONTEMPORARY JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE REVIEW
Vol.04 No.01 (2026)

Intento. (2024). The transition from rule-based to generative models: Low-resource languages and ethical accountability. Intento Report Series.

Irshad, A., & Yasmin, B. (2025). Pedagogical relevance of Shikwa and Jawab-i-Shikwa in Pakistan. Journal of Education and Islamic Thought, 12(1), 34–48.

Karim, S., et al. (2025). LLM-driven annotation agents: Scalability, bias, and transparency. Computational Linguistics, 51(1), 90–112.

Lu, Y., et al. (2025). Translating patient-reported outcomes: GPT-4 vs human translators. Health Communication, 40(2), 150–165.

Maldonado Garcia, M. A. (2016). The lexical influence of Sanskrit, Arabic, and Persian on Urdu. Journal of South Asian Linguistics, 5(2), 77–92.

Marshall, J. (2024). Human translators in the age of AI: Culturally sensitive and high-stakes texts. The Translator, 30(2), 180–195.

Martikainen, O., et al. (2025). GPT-4 in public healthcare translation: Productivity and quality. Translation & Interpreting, 17(1), 55–70.

Mushtaq, A. (2025). Communal introspection in Iqbal's Shikwa and Jawab-i-Shikwa. Iqbal Review, 66(1), 22–35.

Mustafa, F. (2018). Equivalence and functionalist models in poetry translation. Translation Quarterly, 87, 44–59.

Mustafa, S. (2025). Poetry as interpretive act: Metaphor, allegory, and semantic ambiguity. Journal of Literary Semantics, 54(1), 60–75.

Periti, F. (2024). WiDiD: An incremental framework for semantic shift detection. Proceedings of EMNLP, 1100–1115.

Ricoeur, P. (1981). Hermeneutics and the human sciences. Cambridge University Press.

Saadi, N. (2024). Anti-colonial thought in the Muslim world: Iqbal's enduring influence. Middle Eastern Studies, 60(4), 600–615.

Suprayetno, S., et al. (2024). The controversial reception of Shikwa (1911). Journal of Islamic Studies, 35(2), 120–138.

Teddlie, C., & Tashakkori, A. (2009). Foundations of mixed methods research. SAGE.

Van Leuven-Zwart, K. M. (1989). Translation and original: Similarity and dissimilarity. Target, 1(1-2), 69–95.

Vinay, J. P., & Darbelnet, J. (1995). Comparative stylistics of French and English: A methodology for translation. John Benjamins. (Original work published 1958).

Yan, Q., et al. (2024). Subtleties lost: AI translation models and connotative meaning. Computational Linguistics and Intelligent Text Processing, 25, 300–315.