AL-AASAR Journal
Quarterly *Research Journal*
www. al-aasar.com

Vol. 3, No.2 (2026)
Online ISSN: 3006-693X
Print ISSN: 3006-6921

EXPLORING THE SHIFTING NATURE OF NEWS MEDIA: A STUDY FROM HEADLINE TO HASHTAG

M Amir Nawaz
M.Phil. (Scholar), School of Media and Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan. mamirnawaz88@gmial.com
Dr. Tanveer Labar *(Corresponding Author)*
Assistant Professor, Department of Communication and Media Research, School of Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan.
tanveerlabar.dcmr.scs@pu.edu.pk
Sehar Batool
BS (Graduation) Department of Applied Linguistics, Government College University Faisalabad. seharbtoo214@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
This study looks at how news changing from traditional news stories to news that is driven by hashtags on the internet. The researchers used a method to review and combine the results of fifteen studies about news in print on the radio and television and on social media. Headlines are still important because they help people understand what is going on and they are trusted. Hashtags are becoming really powerful because they help people see what is happening and join in on the conversation. The study shows that people are no longer just reading the news they are now actively taking part in creating it sharing it and talking about it on the internet. Not everyone has the same access to the internet and this is causing problems. People who have money, education and know how to use the internet are more likely to be able to use digital news. The change from news to digital news is not happening evenly and we can still see both types of news existing together. This study used a theory that says people use media to get what they want. It shows that people like using the internet because they can interact with others make their own choices and express themselves. This study helps us understand how news is changing how people are responding to it and what the problems are with news. The results of this study are useful for people who work in news make policies teach and do research. The study of news media is important because it helps us see how news is changing and how we can make sure that everyone has access to the news they need.
Key words: *Shifting Nature, Headline, Hashtags, Evolution, Digital-divide, Participation, Engagement, Content Style*

1 Introduction

This study looks at how news media has changed over time. It is called ―Exploring the Shifting Nature of News Media: A Review from Headline to Hashtag. The main goal here is to show how news media has evolved from journalism to digital journalism that uses algorithms. The study explains how news used to be controlled by organizations and their headlines. Now it's more about

what the audience wants. They use hashtags to drive the conversation. This shift involves changes in structure, technology and culture within media. The topic of how news media's changing? How headlines used to be the thing but now hashtags are more important? How these changes are happening because of news and how people engage with it. The study covers the shift from traditional to journalism. It highlights the role of headlines in journalism. Hashtags have become key in news engagement. It looks at technological and cultural changes. News media now is more about audience-driven hashtags.

1.1 Background of the study

Chun & Keenan (2006) reported that from the control of newspapers to the rise of electronic media and then to digital media platforms, each phase has reshaped how news is produced, shared and consumed. The news media has constantly evolved alongside social, political, and technological change. Old media systems trusted heavily on institutional gatekeeping. Where editors and journalists decided what information reached the public. However digital technologies have introduced flexible and interactive media forms. These modifications allow old media practices to be reinterpreted. Historically the headline served as the most important element of news communication in both print and electronic media. Headlines summarized complex events, guided audience attention, and reflected editorial judgment. However, declining circulation and viewership, especially among younger audiences suggest that conventional media struggles to compete with interactive and participatory digital platforms. Instead of disappearing, traditional and new media exist collectively, often supporting each other while serving different audience needs. Dimmick et al. (2004) Reported that emergence of the internet has created a competitive shift effect, particularly in the daily news domain. In accordance with uses and gratifications theory, new media platforms survive by offering broader gratification opportunities than traditional media. Digital platforms provide proximity, personalization, and interactivity, making them more attractive to modern audiences. As a result, television and newspapers face increasing competition because digital media better satisfies modern informational and social needs. In the present media environment, public trust in mainstream press has significantly weakened (Riipa, et al., 2026; Hossain, et al., 2025). News content is now under intense public scrutiny due to misinformation, political associations, and apparent bias within mainstream media organizations. Educated youth increasingly rely on social media platforms such as Facebook, WhatsApp, and X as primary news sources. This shift shows growing dissatisfaction with traditional journalism practices. Also postures serious challenges to the credibility and sustainability of mainstream media (Philips & Subramani, 2024).

Newman (2019) indicated in his research that user-generated content (UGC's) including images and videos, frequently leads television bulletins and newspaper front pages. A defining feature of digital journalism is the increasing role of audiences in news production. Journalists now collaborate with audiences during news gathering and storytelling processes. This indicates a shift in control from media institutions to individual users. The participatory culture has redefined

journalistic authority and blurred the boundary between professional and citizen journalism. Nielson (2015) described that despite digital growth, newspapers continue to play a critical role, particularly in local journalism. No doubt the audience reach and resources have declined yet local newspapers often remain the main organizations conducting systematic, on the ground reporting of local affairs. These newspapers function as ―keystone media, behind the local information ecosystem and most of their content is redistributed through digital platforms. The evolution to digital news consumption has also increased inequalities in access and knowledge. Lythreatis et al. (2022) showed that socioeconomic status is more strongly related to meaningful internet use than to access itself. Digital media use is associated with wider knowledge gaps compared to traditional media, particularly in developing societies.

1.1.1 The Shifting Nature of News Media

These days people are really scrutinizing the news. The news is under a lot of inspection because people over the world are questioning its credibility. People are losing trust in the news. This is a big problem. This is happening because people are not happy, with the way news is being reported nowadays. As a result, people are turning to media for news instead of watching or reading the mainstream news media. (Philips & Subramani, 2024). This shift is about changes in how things are made how products are delivered, how people participate and how we communicate. News media used to be controlled and organized. Now it's more interactive and influenced by computers and how users engage. Old ways of sharing news like headlines are being replaced by new digital ways like using hashtags. News media has moved from being controlled and categorized to being more interactive and driven by algorithms.

1.1.2 Headlines

The headline is the line at the top of a news story or post. The headline is supposed to grab attention and tell what the story is about in a simple word. For example, a newspaper headline will quickly tell what happened so you know what the story is about before read the thing. The headline is really good at getting people to read the story in a few seconds. The headline is, like the beginning of the story. Headlines are made by people who work in news. They are edited by professionals. They are made to help people understand the news in a way that follows the rules of journalism. Rianto & Juliarta (2024) analyzed that the way news is presented has changed a lot with the internet. Now headlines have to compete with hashtags to get people's attention. They take issues and make them into short phrases that people can easily search for and get excited about. The words used in headlines really affect how people interact with news online. Hashtags are like tools that help people see the news get involved and participate in discussions.

1.1.3 Hashtags

People use hashtags to talk about news, on media. They help us find and share news stories. Hashtags are special because they are made by the people who use media not just by news companies. They help us see what a lot of people are saying about one thing. Hashtags are important because they let people work together and express how they feel about something. News

stories are not just written by news companies anymore hashtags show that people are now a part of shaping what we talk about. Hashtags are a way for people to make their voices heard and to bring attention to things that matter to them. Thurman (2017) summarized that by assuming widespread transformations, a meta-analytic review is important to combine existing research on the shift from traditional headlines to digital hash tags. By scientifically examining studies from media field, theoretical frameworks, linguistic practices, and audience behaviors, this research aims to identify overarching patterns and critical gaps. Such an approach provides a comprehensive understanding of how news media has evolved from institutionally controlled headlines to algorithmically amplified hashtags, reshaping public discourse in the digital age**.**

1.2 Problem Statement

What do existing studies collectively reveal about the shift nature of news media from headline-based journalism to hashtag-driven news framing? Regardless of extensive research on traditional headlines, digital hashtags, engagement, and social media communication, existing studies remains fragmented. There is a lack of meta-analytic research that systematically examines how news media has shifted from organizational controlled headlines to algorithm driven hashtag. Also the relation between language change, audience participation, and structural differences such as digital divide has not been appropriately highlighted. This gap limits comprehensive understanding of contemporary news media transformation.

1.3 Objectives of the Study

Following are the main objectives of this study

1. To examine the transformation of news media from headline to hashtag-driven communication.
2. To analyze changes in audience engagement across traditional and digital media platforms.
3. To evaluate the moderating role of the digital divide in present news consumption.

1.4 Significance of the Study

This study has theoretical, academic, and practical significance. Theoretically, it contributes to media and communication studies by addition of classical and current media researches within a meta-analytic structure. Academically, it clears a critical research gap by providing an organized combination of headline- and hashtag-focused studies along with a comprehensive understanding of news media evolution. Practically, the outcomes offer insights for journalists, media systems, stakeholders, and learners looking for adjustment to shifting news consumption designs while maintaining credibility and independent values.

2. Literature review

Dimmick et al. (2004) concluded that the Internet has a competitive shift effect on traditional media in the daily news domain largely on television and newspapers. The Internet has the largest position on the gratification opportunities, providing users satisfaction with more needs than any of the traditional media on this aspect. Kyong et al. (2004) provided new benchmarks for evaluating all kinds of claims political, social, and ethical made about the digital age. The researcher combined

historical research with fresh theoretical ideas and argued that, thanks to digital technology's ability to be programmed and changed, we can revive and rethink parts of media history that we often dismiss as ―old.‖ User-generated picture or video scoops regularly lead television bulletins and the front pages of newspapers. He also elaborated how mainstream media organizations are responding to this wave of participatory and social media, linked with a historic shift in control towards individual consumers. Newman (2009) claimed that a newspaper's main product is not news or information, but influence: societal influence, which is not for sale, and commercial influence. Meyer (2009) suggested that understanding the relationship between quality and profit maybe will not save traditional newspapers, but such knowledge can guide new media initiatives. He believed that we have the tools to sustain high-quality journalism and preserve its unique social functions, though in a transformed way. His controversial suggestion, making certification available for reporters and editors, has gained ground. We believe that the layout of newspapers may change, but the content is still in the form of news. Even though the conventional media have their own online versions, they have not fully embraced the new technology. Even if there is a drop in circulation, it would be because the younger generation prefers the new media as they are more interactive compared to the online version of mainstream. The new media and conventional media will continue to coexist and reinforce each other (Ali et al. 2011). Socioeconomic status is more closely associated with the informational use of the Internet than with access to the Internet. In addition, socioeconomic status is more strongly related to the informational use of the Internet than with that of the traditional media, particularly newspapers and television. More importantly, the differential use of the Internet is associated with a greater knowledge gap than that of the traditional media. Findings suggest that digital divide, which can be better defined as inequalities in the meaningful use of information and communication technologies, matters more than its traditional counterpart (Wei & Hindman, 2011).

Visnovsky (2015) Concluded that newspapers are currently looking for new ways of distribution and new forms of existence, especially in electronic environment, in order to attract the readers – users of new media and various technologies related to them. Their success fully depends on effective using of these technologies by people with physical disabilities or other disadvantages. Since these media also carry information contents, the form of the presentation of information always corresponds with the overall character of given medium. Mainly for this reason, the number of new applications for smartphones, tablets or smart televisions is increasing in these days. Shabir et al. (2015) Established that print media is maintaining its status. Moreover, print media is the foundation of journalism on which rest of the media is developed including electronic media and social media. In the modern age, print media and electronic media are considers two edge of river that become together. But the print media is backbone of all kind of media. Print media give comprehensive news in the shape of analysis, editorials and columns. It is also noticed that giving more coverage to local news is the key point of popularity of print media among local people that is usually not highlighted by the electronic media. Hurdles that are affecting the print media are

low literacy rate, financial problems and limited circulation. The local daily newspaper, despite its diminished audience reach and editorial resources, has become an increasingly important node in the circulation of independent and professionally produced news about local affairs as other news organizations have pulled out of the locality and no new providers have emerged. Citizens in the community studied have access to more and more media, but less and less news, most of it originating with a single news organization—the local daily newspaper. study suggests that local newspapers—reporting across platforms but still sustained by their eroding print business—despite the well-known challenges they face in a changing and increasingly digital media environment, despite their dwindling editorial resources, and despite their diminished reach, may thus ironically become more important for local journalism as our media environment change, because they increasingly are the only organizations doing ongoing on-the-ground reporting on local public affairs. They are not so much mainstream media—for the majority does not rely directly on them for information, and most of what they produce is disseminated no farther than to their own readers—as keystone media in a local information environment, playing a critical role in the production and circulation of information with ecological consequences well beyond their own audience (Nielsen, 2015). The way we formulate headlines matters. Headlines play a key role in attracting and engaging online audiences. With the increasing usage of mobile apps and social media to consume news, headlines are the most prominent -- and often the only -- part of the news article visible to readers. Research established that computational methods can be reliably used to characterize headlines in terms of news values and linguistic style features; and that most of these features significantly correlate with social media popularity and to a lesser extent with perceived popularity. Headline wording has an effect on social media popularity. Findings indicate that formulating a headline in a certain way can lead to wider readership engagement (Piotrkowicz, 2017).

Ritonga (2019) Citizen journalism was initially practiced via mass media. This is because citizens trusted mass media as an independent information channel, and social media like Twitter was unavailable. Following mass media's affiliation to political parties and the rise of social media, citizens began using Twitter for delivering news or information. We dub this as citizen journalism from street to tweet. New emerging phenomenon caused by the advent of new media in the post-truth era. In this context, post-truth refers to social and political conditions. Thurman & Fletcher (2019) stated that its important to understand the determinants of newspaper use.

Earlier studies found age to be the principal determinant, but did not account for newspapers' online editions. results show (1) the time spent with newspaper brands fell by 40 per cent, even as online platforms made access easier and cheaper; (2) the proportional decrease in time spent was greatest for the youngest age group and smallest for the oldest; and (3) there are important variations between individual newspaper brands, a result, we propose, of differences in their multiplatform strategies. Digital distribution has, little impact on previously observed cohort effects but has enabled changes in media use that have shaped the attention given to newspapers and will continue

to do so. The last few years have seen a rise in activism and online technology has caught on this wave of change. More than ever, conversations are driven, gatherings are optimized, and thoughts are shared through a disproportionally small tool compared to its impact: the hashtag. allows for the reading of the hashtag as a cultural object that perpetuates the movement's political agenda in the public sphere and bridges personal and collective experiences under the #MeToo myth., to contribute to the broader conversation on the place of digital tools in our construction of reality by theorizing that hashtags in digital activism can be read as a driver of change due to their cultural impact on the public imaginary around social movements prevalent on social media (Dobrin, 2020).

Kumar et al. (2022) found that trademarking hashtags plays a pivotal role in increasing social media audience engagement and information dissemination. More importantly, this positive effect is stronger for firms with fewer Twitter followers. we find that trademarking hashtags makes composing tweets with certain linguistic styles more critical: It can amplify the positive effects of trademarking hashtags on social media audience engagement. Lythreatis et al. (2022) Provides a systematic review of the digital divide, a phenomenon which refers to disparities in Information and Communications Technology access, usage, and outcomes. It uniquely identifies the factors affecting the digital divide that have emerged in recent years (2017–2021) findings, show that the factors affecting the digital divide can be classified into three different segments and nine main categories: sociodemographic, socioeconomic, personal elements, social support, and type of technology, digital training, rights, infrastructure, and large-scale events. Out of all factors, education has been linked to the digital divide the most. a new form, type-ofinternet access, and two potential new levels of the digital divide, algorithmic awareness and data inequalities, have been identified in the contemporary literature. In the contemporary era, news reports are subject to intense public scrutiny due to the global credibility audit. This decline is believed to be a consequence of the prevailing discontent and dismay with the contemporary journalism ecosystem, leading to a shift in public preference from mainstream media to social media as a news source. Educated youth residing in cities extensively utilize Facebook, WhatsApp, and other platforms as their primary source for accessing online news, accompanied by a notable rise in distrust. This phenomenon endangers the long-term viability of mainstream media outlets, and the decline in objectivity observed in Indian media lends credibility to this concern (Philips & Subramani, 2024). (Almakaty, 2024) explored the evolution of mass communication theories in the context of digital media, emphasizing the decline of traditional models and the rise of innovative paradigms. He argued that historical theories, such as the Hypodermic Needle Theory, fall short in explaining the complexities of modern digital interactions due to their linear and passive assumptions. the transition to new theories, such as Network Society Theory and Algorithmic Media Theory, which better encapsulate the interactive and decentralized nature of contemporary media landscapes. Findings illustrate the urgent need for a reevaluation of communication models, supported by global examples that highlight the transformative impact of digital media on audience engagement

and content dissemination. Panjaitan & ria (2024) The growing popularity of social media has influenced the linguistic sphere in the digital age. Influences are obvious in how language is used in digital communication. The results point out linguistic economy tends to be the main factor for linguistic simplification due to favor of speediness and character limitation. Furthermore, younger generations are reported to use abbreviations in academic and professional settings, suggesting that these changes may contribute to long-term shifts in linguistic norms. Regarding syntax and grammar variation, the reviewed studies suggest that non-standard grammar used on social media contributes to a new stylistic register that is informal yet effective in conveying intent quickly and with minimal effort. These findings suggest that social media is influential in language evolution, particularly among youth, and its implications for language preservation, education, and cultural identity should be considered.

2.1 Research Gaps

In spite of extensive studies on traditional journalism, digital media, and audience behavior, some serious gaps remain noticeable:

1. Fragmentation of Research

Existing studies examine headlines, hashtags, audience participation, and digital divide separately, lacking a connected examined background.

2. Lack of Meta-Analytic Synthesis 3. Audience engagement

In traditional news platforms like newspapers and electronic media the audience participation was zero and hence not thoroughly described in existing literature.

There is absence of meta-analysis research that scientifically combines findings of many studies to identify main patterns in the headline-to-hashtag shift.

4. Role of Digital Divide

Though digital divide is well researched, but its controlling role in news medium selection and engagement in traditional and digital environment remains unsatisfactorily linked to news discourse shift.

These gaps justify the need for a meta-analytic review that integrates media transformation, audience engagement, linguistic change, and digital inequality within a single analytical structure.

2.2 Theoretical Framework

The study is sustained by Uses and Gratifications Theory (UGT), which describes media consumption as an active practice motivated by audience requirements and impulses instead of passive experience.

2.3 Explanation of the Theory

Uses and Gratifications Theory proposes that viewers actively select media to fulfill particular needs such as information, entertainment, interaction and contribution. Dissimilar from traditional theories, Uses and Gratifications Theory highlights audience activity and selection. In digital era, this theory seems relevant, as users can maintain content selection, interaction with creation, and participation in news circulation. Digital platforms increase satisfaction chances by proposing

proximity, interactivity, personalization, and connectivity. Especially Hashtags permit users to fulfill needs for expression, activism, and visibility.

2.4 Relevance of Theory

This theory is highly relevant to the study because of many causes:

1. It clarifies why audiences gradually prefer hashtags over headlines as tools for reading and attracting with news.
2. It interprets audience participation in news creation and circulation.
3. It helps to understand the coexistence of traditional and digital media, as different media serves different audience needs.
4. It offers a theoretical basis for understanding how digital divide upsets gratification results.

By relating Uses and Gratifications Theory, the present study scientifically connects audience impulses with the organizational shift from headlines to hashtags.

2.5 Research Questions

According to the objectives and literature review of study, the following research questions are framed:

1. How has news format changed from traditional headlines to digital hashtag-based communication?
2. What variations exist in audience engagement among headline and hashtag-driven news medium?
3. In what ways digital divide moderate news consumption across old and digital media?

3. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Research Design

In this study meta-analytic research design is used which is suitable for methodically creating and understanding results from existing literature. Meta-analysis permits to move outside individual study limits by identifying patterns, uniformities, and flaws in a selected group of literature. Instead of gathering primary data, this study depends on on secondary data derived from already published articles.

According to the nature of research problem—examining the shift of news media from headlines to hashtags meta-analysis method is appropriate. It allows a complete understanding of how news production and audience engagement have evolved among different media settings.

3.2 Conceptualization of the Study

This study conceptualizes news media shift, starting from editorial, organized headlines to participatory, algorithm-driven hashtags. Headlines shows traditional gatekeeping and one way news flow, but hashtags highlights visibility, user participation, and interacted circulation of news. The shift is studied through print, electronic, and digital media atmospheres by using a meta-analysis method on published studies.

At the conceptual level, the study accepts that technical change modifies:

- News production
- News framing (Headlines and Hashtags)
- Audience engagement

3.3 Population of the Study

Population of this study is reviewed academic previously published research articles focusing on:

- Traditional news media (print and electronic)
- Digital/social media (X, Facebook etc.)
- Headlines and news framing
- Hashtags and audience engagement
- Digital divide and news consumption

3.4 Sampling Technique and Sample Size

Purposive sampling technique is used to select studies that directly line up with the objectives of the study. From literature reviewed in Chapter 2, 15 articles were purposely selected based on significance, thematic clearness, and theoretical impact.

To preserve analytical balance, the sample was divided as below:

- 8 articles focusing on headlines and traditional media
- 7 articles focusing on hashtags and digital media

This equal selection guarantees that both traditional and digital news media are sufficiently studied in the meta-analytic context.

3.5 Themes

On the basis of objectives and literature following themes are identified:

1. Shift of News Media (Transformation from print/broadcast to digital platforms)
2. Headlines as Institutional News element (Editorial control, framing)
3. Hashtags as Participatory News Discourse (Audience engagement)
4. Audience engagement (Citizen journalism, user-generated content)
5. Digital Divide and News Consumption (Inequality in access, usage, and outcomes)

3.6 Data Gathering

Data is collected by organized analysis of the selected 15 research articles. Each article is reviewed to abstract information related to:

- Media type (traditional or digital)
- Key findings about the news transformation (headline or hashtag)
- Audience engagement
- Digital divide (availability of tools and socioeconomic aspects)

3.7 Data Analysis Technique

The study uses qualitative thematic meta-analysis, to examine resemblances and changes in studies while maintaining theoretical deepness. Analysis involves following steps:

1. Classification of studies into headlines and hashtags focused groups

2. Coding of findings according to defined themes
3. Relative analysis among traditional and digital media studies
4. Interpretive arrangement to identify primary trends and patterns

3.8 Measurement Strategy

As study is based on qualitative meta-analysis, measurement is conceptual instead of statistical. Following indicators are used:

- News form (headline vs. hashtag)
- audience engagement (passive vs. participatory)
- Media platform used (print/electronic, social media)
- digital divide factors (Access and variation)

3.9 Unit of Analysis

Each individual research article is unit of analysis for this study. Every selected article is used as a single analytical unit contributing as evidence to understanding the larger shift of news media.

4. DATA PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS

4.1 Data Presentation

Categorization of Studies

For systematic presentation, selected studies are categorized into two main groups:

1. Headline-Oriented Studies
   These studies focus on newspapers, television, editorial control, and headline design as institutional news format.
2. Hashtag-Oriented Studies
   These studies focus on social media, participatory journalism, hashtags and audience engagement.

These categorize allows the comparative analysis of traditional and digital news discourse.

4.2 Thematic Data Analysis

4.3.1 Transformation of News Media

A main theme in analyzed studies is the operational shift of news media. Traditional media operates under central editorial authority; however digital media function by decentralized, interacted systems.

Dimmick et al. (2004) clearly described this shift as a ***"competitive displacement effect"***, arguing that the internet survives and prospers by providing ***"broader gratification opportunities than traditional media."*** This finding supports the argument presented in Chapter 1 that digital platforms do not merely enhance traditional media but actively compete with and reshape it.

Chun et al. (2004) provided a historical lens, stating that digital technologies allow scholars to ***"rediscover and rethink parts of media history that we often dismiss as old."*** This reinforces the idea that the shift from headlines to hashtags is evolutionary rather than revolutionary, involving reinterpretation rather than total replacement. Ali et al. (2011) further support this hybrid model by concluding that ***"new media and conventional media will continue to coexist and reinforce each***

other." This coexistence is evident in contemporary newsrooms where headlines are repurposed into social media posts and hashtags.

4.3.2 Headlines as Institutional News Discourse

The analysis of studies focused on headline reveals that headlines remain central to journalism practices, even in the digital era. Headlines function as framing devices that shows editorial judgment and institutional policy. Meyer (2009) argues that ***"a newspaper's main product is not news or information, but influence."*** This highlights the representative power of headlines, which creates public opinion and political discourse beyond just information broadcast.

Piotrkowicz (2017) demonstrates that ***"headline wording has an effect on social media popularity."*** By using computational methods, study highlights that linguistic features inserted in headlines relate with online engagement, proposing that traditional headline practices continue to affect digital visibility.

Shabir et al. (2015) strengthen institutional role by describing ***"print media is backbone of all kinds of media,"*** highlighting that headlines in print journalism offer depth, analysis, and credibility that digital platforms often do not.

Nielsen (2015) presents the concept that ***"newspapers is keystone media,"*** stating that ***"local newspapers remain the only organizations doing ongoing on-the-ground reporting."*** Headlines continue to feed digital ecosystems, even when audiences consume them indirectly through social media.

These findings collectively reveal that headlines remain foundational to news production, serving as the original framing units even when reorganized digitally.

4.3.3 Emergence of Hashtags

Hashtag-oriented studies show a shift toward participatory, user-driven news discourse. Hashtags function as both linguistic and technological tools that organize, increase, and mobilize news content. Ritonga (2019) describes this shift as ***"citizen journalism from street to tweet,"*** observing that citizens mainly use platforms like Twitter to distribute news due to decreasing trust in politically allied mainstream media. This quote summarizes the movement from physical reporting modes to digital ones.

Dobrin (2020) represents hashtags as cultural objects, arguing that ***"hashtags bridge personal and collective experiences"*** and act as ***"drivers of change due to their cultural impact on the public imaginary."*** The #MeToo movement serves as a solid example when a hashtag replaced traditional headlines in shaping global discourse.

Kumar et al. (2022) provide experimental support by finding that ***"trademarking hashtags plays a pivotal role in increasing social media audience engagement."*** Their study displays that hashtags increase information spreading, mostly for organizations with lesser followings.

Panjaitan and Patria (2024) highlight linguistic transformation, observing that social media encourages ―linguistic economy‖ and the use of easy grammar and abbreviations. Hashtags exemplify this trend by summarizing complex issues into short, searchable expressions.

Collectively, these studies confirm that hashtags represent a new form of news discourse that prioritizes speed, visibility, emotional significance, and participation over editorial complexity.

4.3.4 Audience Engagement

One of the most important findings from the analyzed literature is the transformation of audiences from passive consumers to active participants in news production and distribution.

Newman (2009) stated that ***"user-generated picture or video scoops regularly lead television bulletins and front pages of newspapers."*** This quote shows how audience contributions now compete with, and sometimes surpass, professional journalism.

Thurman and Fletcher (2019) note that ***"time spent with newspaper brands fell by 40 per cent,"*** particularly among younger audiences. This decline is attributed to digital platforms offering interactive and participatory experiences that traditional media struggle to replicate.

Uses and Gratifications Theory helps explain this shift. Digital platforms allow users to satisfy needs for expression, social interaction, and identity formation—needs that hashtags fulfill more effectively than headlines. For example, a traditional headline may inform audiences about a protest, while a hashtag like #BlackLivesMatter allows users to participate, share experiences, and mobilize collectively. This difference highlights the qualitative difference in engagement between headlines and hashtags.

4.3.5 Digital Divide as a Moderating Factor

While digital media offers expanded participation, the literature constantly highlights inequalities in access and meaningful use.

Wei and Hindman (2011) conclude that ***"socioeconomic status is more strongly related to informational use of the internet than access itself."*** This finding challenges the assumption that digital media automatically democratizes news consumption.

Lythreatis et al. (2022) further identify new levels of digital divide, including ***"algorithmic awareness and data inequalities."*** These forms of inequality influence who can effectively use hashtags and participate in digital discourse.

Philips and Subramani (2024) observe that educated urban youth dominate digital news consumption, while other segments remain reliant on traditional media. This uneven transition suggests that headlines and hashtags coexist partly due to structural inequalities.

5. CONCLUSION

5.1 Discussion

5.1.1 Transformation of News Media

The central finding of this study is that the transformation of news media is not a linear replacement of old media by new media but a redesign of the entire media environment. Metaanalysis confirms that traditional media institutions especially newspapers continue to play a foundational role in news production.

As discussed earlier, Dimmick, Chen, and Zhan (2004) argue that internet provides a

―competitive displacement effect‖ by offering broader gratification opportunities. However, the findings of this study establish that displacement does not equate to elimination. Instead, headlines produced by traditional media often serve as the raw material for digital circulation, while hashtags strengthen and reframe those narratives.

This coexistence supports the argument by Ali et al. (2011) that traditional and new media reinforce each other. Traditional journalism provides credibility, verification, and depth, while digital platforms provide speed, reach, and interaction. So the shift from headline to hashtag represents a redistribution of functions rather than a collapse of journalistic norms.

5.1.2 Headlines: Stable Authority in a Digital Environment

The analysis confirms that headlines remain central to news discourse despite declining print circulation and television viewership. Headlines continue to function as authoritative framing devices that shape how news is interpreted, prioritized, and remembered.

Meyer's (2009) declared that journalism's primary product is ―influence‖ rather than information is particularly relevant here. Headlines summarize institutional power by defining what is newsworthy and how it should be understood. Even in digital contexts, headline wording significantly affects visibility and engagement, as verified by Piotrkowicz (2017).

The perseverance of headlines is also evident in the concept of ―keystone media‖ introduced by Nielsen (2015). Local newspapers, despite reduced resources, remain the primary producers of original news content. Their headlines often initiate news cycles that are later disseminated and transformed on social media platforms.

So, instead of becoming outdated, headlines have been repositioned within a hybrid media system. They now operate as the starting point of news discourse rather than its final destination.

5.1.3 Hashtags as a New Form of News Discourse

In contrast to headlines, hashtags represent a fundamentally different mode of news communication. The findings of this study indicate that hashtags function simultaneously as linguistic symbols, organizational tools, and tools of participation.

Ritonga's (2019) description of citizen journalism ―from street to tweet‖ captures the essence of this transformation. Hashtags enable ordinary users to bypass institutional gatekeeping and directly participate in news dissemination. This shift is particularly significant in contexts where mainstream media are perceived as politically affiliated or biased.

Dobrin's (2020) analysis of hashtags as cultural objects further deepens this understanding. Hashtags such as #MeToo or #BlackLivesMatter do not merely label content; they create shared meanings, mobilize collective identities, and sustain public conversations over time. In this sense, hashtags function as discursive spaces rather than simple textual tags.

Kumar et al. (2022) provide experimental support for the effectiveness of hashtags in enhancing engagement and information dissemination.Their findings suggest that hashtags regularize visibility, particularly for actors with limited institutional power or smaller audiences.

Overall, the study confirms that hashtags have emerged as a dominant form of digital news discourse, characterized by speed and participatory potential.

5.1.4 Audience Engagement: From Consumption to Participation

A major contribution of this study lies in its analysis of changing audience roles. The metanalysis reveals a clear transition from passive consumption to active participation in news processes. Traditional media positioned audiences as receivers of information, with limited opportunities for feedback or involvement. In contrast, digital platforms enable audiences to comment, share, remix, and even produce news content. Newman's (2009) observation that user-generated content frequently leads mainstream news coverage illustrates this shift in power dynamics. Uses and Gratifications Theory provides a strong explanatory framework for this transformation. Digital platforms satisfy a wider range of audience needs, including self-expression, social interaction, and identity construction. Hashtags, in particular, allow users to align themselves with causes, communities, and narratives, thereby increasing emotional investment and engagement. The decline in time spent for reading newspaper reported by Thurman and Fletcher (2019) further highlights this shift. Younger audiences incline toward platforms that offer interaction rather than one-way communication. This change does not suggest a rejection of news but rather a redefinition of how news is experienced and valued.

5.1.5 Digital Divide and Unequal Participation

While digital media expands opportunities for participation, the study highlights existing and evolving inequalities in news acce0ss and engagement. The digital divide emerges as a crucial moderating factor in the transformation from headlines to hashtags. Wei and Hindman (2011) emphasize that socioeconomic status is more strongly related to meaningful internet use than to access alone. This finding challenges technological determinism and underscores the importance of skills, education, and social capital. Lythreatis et al. (2022) further identify new dimensions of digital inequality, including algorithmic awareness and data inequalities. These factors influence who can effectively use hashtags to participate in news discourse and whose voices are raised. Philips and Subramani (2024) observe that educated urban youth dominate digital news consumption, while other groups remain dependent on traditional media. This uneven transition explains why headlines and hashtags continue to coexist. Traditional media remains essential for audiences excluded from digital participation. Thus, the shift from headlines to hashtags is not uniform or universal. It is shaped by structural inequalities that affect access, skills, and participation.

5.2 Conclusion

This study set out to explore the shifting nature of news media from traditional headline-based discourse to digital hashtag-driven communication through a meta-analytic review of fifteen scholarly articles. The findings validate that this shift is multifaceted, involving changes in media structures, audience roles and power relations. The study concludes that headlines and hashtags are not mutually exclusive but operate within a hybrid media ecosystem. Headlines continue to

provide credibility, depth, and institutional framing, while hashtags strengthen, mobilize, and personalize news discourse. Audience engagement has evolved from passive consumption to active participation. At the same time, the transformation is moderated by the digital divide, which creates unequal opportunities for participation and influence. Overall, the shift from headline to hashtag represents an alteration of journalism rather than its decline. It signals an ongoing negotiation between institutional authority and participatory culture in the digital age.

5.3 Recommendations

Recommendations for Media Organizations

1. Traditional media should adopt hybrid strategies that assimilate headline credibility with hashtag-driven engagement.
2. Newsrooms should develop ethical guidelines for hashtag use to prevent misinformation and sensationalism.
3. Journalists should be trained in digital literacy and algorithmic awareness to better navigate platform-driven news distribution.

Recommendations for Policymakers

1. Policymakers should address digital inequality by promoting meaningful internet use rather than access alone.
2. Support should be provided to local and public-interest journalism, which remains foundational to democratic discourse.

Recommendations for Academia and Future Research

1. Future studies should conduct empirical meta-analyses including quantitative measures of engagement.
2. Comparative research across developed and developing contexts would deepen understanding of digital inequality.
3. Further exploration of linguistic consequences of hashtag journalism is needed, particularly its impact on public reasoning.

Recommendations for Media Education

1. Media literacy curriculum should teach audiences to critically evaluate both headlines and hashtags.
2. Journalism education should emphasize ethical participation, balancing speed with verification.
3. Students should be trained to understand the social and cultural power of digital discourse tools.

References

A. S., F. I., Hj Abdullah, M. Y., N. M., Mahbob, M. H., & Salman, A. (2011). The impact of new media on traditional mainstream mass media. *The Innovation Journal: The Public Sector Innovation Journal, 16*(3), 1-11.

Almakaty, S. (2024). The Evolution of Mass Communication Theories in the Age of Digital Media: The Decline of Traditional Models and the Rise of New Paradigms. *Preprints*.

Chun, W. H., & Keenan, T. (2006). *New Media, Old Media.* Routledge Home.

Dimmick, J., Chen, Y., & Zhan, L. (2004). Competition between the Internet and traditional news media: The gratification-opportunities niche dimension. *The journal of media economics, 17*(1), 19-33.

Dobrin, D. (2020). The hashtag in digital activism: A cultural revolution. *Journal of Cultural Analysis and Social Change, 5*(1).

Hossain, A., Tasnim, A. F., Akhter, F., Semi, M. M. A., Khan, R., Rahman, R., ... & Sabeena, A. A. (2025). Transforming Healthcare Decisions in the US Through Machine Learning. Artificial Intelligence, 1(2).

Kumar, N., Qiu, L., & Kumar, S. (2022). A Hashtag Is Worth a Thousand Words: An Empirical Investigation of Social Media Strategies in Trademarking Hashtags. *Information Systems Research*.

Kyong Chun, W. H., Watkins , A., & Thomas . (2004). *New media, old media: A history and theory reader.* New York: Routledge.

Lythreatis, S., Singh, S. K., & Kassar, A. N. (2022). The digital divide: A review and future research agenda. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change, 175*, 121-359.

Meyer, P. (2009). The vanishing newspaper: Saving journalism in the information age. *University of Missouri Press*.

N, N. (2009). *The rise of social media and its impact on mainstream journalism.* Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism.

Newman, N. (2009). The rise of social media and its impact on mainstream journalism. *Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, Department of Politics and International Relations, University of Oxford*.

Newman, N. (2019). Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2019. *SSRN*.

Nielsen, R. K. (2015). Local newspapers as keystone media: The increased importance of diminished newspapers for local political information environments. *Pre-publication version of chapter in Rasmus Kleis Nielsen (ed.)*. .

Panjaitan, L. L., & Patria, A. N. (2024). Social media and language evolution: The impact of digital communication on language change. *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Translation, 7*(2), 53-57.

Philips, J., & Subramani, R. (2024). Rising distrust: Digital media dethrones mainstream media. *Pro Metrics*, 1-12.

Vol. 3, No.2 (2026)
Online ISSN: 3006-693X
Print ISSN: 3006-6921

Piotrkowicz, A. (2017). Modelling social media popularity of news articles using headline text. *University of Leeds*.

Rianto, S., & Juliarta, I. M. (2024). The Impact of Social Media on Language Use Among Teenagers. *ResearchGate*.

Riipa, M. B., Ahmed, F., Rony, M. K. K., Hossain, A., Islam, A., Utsho, M. R., ... & Tasnim, A. F. (2026). The role of artificial intelligence in predicting cardiovascular outcomes: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Biostatistics & Epidemiology*, *10*(1), e2670804.

Ritonga, R. (2019). Citizen journalism and public participation in the era of new media in Indonesia: From street to tweet. *Media and Communication*.

Shabir, G., Safdar, G., Seyal, A. M., Imran, M., & Bukhari, A. R. (2015). Maintaining Print Media in Modern Age: A Case Study of Pakistan. *Asian Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities, 4*(2).

Thurman, N. (2017). Newspaper Consumption in the Mobile Age: Re-assessing multi-platform performance and market share using ―time-spent‖. *Journalism Studies*, 1-21.

Thurman, N., & Fletcher, R. (2019). Has digital distribution rejuvenated readership? Revisiting the age demographics of newspaper consumption. *Journalism Studies, 20*(4), 542-562.

Visnovsky, J. (2015). Print Journalism in the Era of Electronic Media. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*.

Wei, L., & Hindman, D. B. (2011). Does the digital divide matter more? Comparing the effects of new media and old media use on the education-based knowledge gap. *Mass Communication and Society, 14*(2), 216-235.